

# Monotonicity, thinning and discrete versions of the Entropy Power Inequality

Joint work with Yaming Yu – see arXiv:0909.0641

Oliver Johnson

`O.Johnson@bristol.ac.uk`

`http://www.stats.bris.ac.uk/~maotj`

Statistics Group, University of Bristol

24th June 2010

# Abstract

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:
  1. Maximum entropy

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:
  1. Maximum entropy
  2. Entropy power inequality

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:
  1. Maximum entropy
  2. Entropy power inequality
  3. Monotonicity



# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:
  1. Maximum entropy
  2. Entropy power inequality
  3. Monotonicity
- ▶ Will discuss discrete analogues for discrete entropy  
 $H = \sum_x p(x) \log p(x)$ .

# Abstract

- ▶ Differential entropy  $h = - \int f(x) \log f(x) dx$  has many nice properties.
- ▶ Often Gaussian provides case of equality.
- ▶ Focus on 3 such properties:
  1. Maximum entropy
  2. Entropy power inequality
  3. Monotonicity
- ▶ Will discuss discrete analogues for discrete entropy  
 $H = \sum_x p(x) \log p(x)$ .
- ▶ Infinite divisibility suggests Poisson should be case of equality.

# Property 1: Maximum entropy

## Theorem (Shannon 1948)

If  $X$  has mean  $\mu$  and variance  $\sigma$  and  $Y \sim N(\mu, \sigma^2)$  then

$$h(X) \leq h(Y),$$

with equality if and only if  $X \sim N(\mu, \sigma^2)$ .

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .
- ▶ Define entropy power  $\nu(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(h(X)) = 2^{2h(X)} / (2\pi e)$ .

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .
- ▶ Define entropy power  $v(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(h(X)) = 2^{2h(X)}/(2\pi e)$ .

### Theorem (EPI)

*Consider independent continuous  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$v(X + Y) \geq v(X) + v(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Gaussian.*

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .
- ▶ Define entropy power  $v(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(h(X)) = 2^{2h(X)}/(2\pi e)$ .

### Theorem (EPI)

*Consider independent continuous  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$v(X + Y) \geq v(X) + v(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Gaussian.*

- ▶ First stated by Shannon.



## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .
- ▶ Define entropy power  $v(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(h(X)) = 2^{2h(X)}/(2\pi e)$ .

### Theorem (EPI)

*Consider independent continuous  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$v(X + Y) \geq v(X) + v(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Gaussian.*

- ▶ First stated by Shannon.
- ▶ Lots of proofs (Stam/Blachman, Lieb, Dembo/Cover/Thomas, Tulino/Verdú/Guo).

## Property 2: Entropy Power Inequality

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = h(N(0, t)) = \frac{1}{2} \log_2(2\pi et)$ .
- ▶ Define entropy power  $v(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(h(X)) = 2^{2h(X)}/(2\pi e)$ .

### Theorem (EPI)

*Consider independent continuous  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$v(X + Y) \geq v(X) + v(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Gaussian.*

- ▶ First stated by Shannon.
- ▶ Lots of proofs (Stam/Blachman, Lieb, Dembo/Cover/Thomas, Tulino/Verdú/Guo).
- ▶ Restricted versions easier to prove? (cf Costa).

## Equivalent formulation

Theorem (ECI – not proved here!)

For independent  $X^*, Y^*$  with finite variance, for all  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ ,

$$h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \geq \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*).$$

Lemma

*EPI is equivalent to ECI.*

## Equivalent formulation

Theorem (ECI – not proved here!)

For independent  $X^*, Y^*$  with finite variance, for all  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ ,

$$h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \geq \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*).$$

### Lemma

*EPI is equivalent to ECI.*

- ▶ Key role played in Lemma by fact about scaling:

$$v(\sqrt{\alpha}X) = \alpha v(X). \quad (1)$$

## Equivalent formulation

Theorem (ECI – not proved here!)

For independent  $X^*, Y^*$  with finite variance, for all  $\alpha \in [0, 1]$ ,

$$h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \geq \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*).$$

### Lemma

EPI is equivalent to ECI.

- ▶ Key role played in Lemma by fact about scaling:

$$v(\sqrt{\alpha}X) = \alpha v(X). \quad (1)$$

- ▶ This holds since  $h(\sqrt{\alpha}X) = h(X) + \frac{1}{2} \log \alpha$ , and  $v(\sqrt{\alpha}X) = 2^{2h(\sqrt{\alpha}X)} / (2\pi e)$ .

# Proof of Lemma: EPI implies ECI

## Proof of Lemma: EPI implies ECI

- ▶ By the EPI (where  $X = \sqrt{\alpha}X^*$  and  $Y = \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*$ ) and scaling relation (1),

$$\begin{aligned}v(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) &\geq v(\sqrt{\alpha}X^*) + v(\sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \\ &= \alpha v(X^*) + (1-\alpha)v(Y^*).\end{aligned}$$

## Proof of Lemma: EPI implies ECI

- ▶ By the EPI (where  $X = \sqrt{\alpha}X^*$  and  $Y = \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*$ ) and scaling relation (1),

$$\begin{aligned} v(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) &\geq v(\sqrt{\alpha}X^*) + v(\sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \\ &= \alpha v(X^*) + (1-\alpha)v(Y^*). \end{aligned}$$

- ▶ Applying  $\mathcal{E}$  to both sides and using Jensen (since  $\mathcal{E} \sim \log$ , so is concave):

$$\begin{aligned} h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) &\geq \mathcal{E}\left(\alpha v(X^*) + (1-\alpha)v(Y^*)\right) \\ &\geq \alpha \mathcal{E}(v(X^*)) + (1-\alpha)\mathcal{E}(v(Y^*)) \\ &= \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*) \end{aligned}$$

which is the ECI.



# Proof of Lemma: ECI implies EPI

## Proof of Lemma: ECI implies EPI

- ▶ For some  $\alpha$ , define  $X^* = X/\sqrt{\alpha}$  and  $Y^* = Y/\sqrt{1-\alpha}$ .

## Proof of Lemma: ECI implies EPI

- ▶ For some  $\alpha$ , define  $X^* = X/\sqrt{\alpha}$  and  $Y^* = Y/\sqrt{1-\alpha}$ .
- ▶ Then the ECI and scaling (1) imply that

$$\begin{aligned}h(X + Y) &= h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \\ &\geq \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*) \\ &= \alpha \mathcal{E}(v(X^*)) + (1-\alpha)\mathcal{E}(v(Y^*)) \\ &= \alpha \mathcal{E}\left(\frac{v(X)}{\alpha}\right) + (1-\alpha)\mathcal{E}\left(\frac{v(Y)}{1-\alpha}\right)\end{aligned}$$

## Proof of Lemma: ECI implies EPI

- ▶ For some  $\alpha$ , define  $X^* = X/\sqrt{\alpha}$  and  $Y^* = Y/\sqrt{1-\alpha}$ .
- ▶ Then the ECI and scaling (1) imply that

$$\begin{aligned}
 h(X + Y) &= h(\sqrt{\alpha}X^* + \sqrt{1-\alpha}Y^*) \\
 &\geq \alpha h(X^*) + (1-\alpha)h(Y^*) \\
 &= \alpha \mathcal{E}(v(X^*)) + (1-\alpha)\mathcal{E}(v(Y^*)) \\
 &= \alpha \mathcal{E}\left(\frac{v(X)}{\alpha}\right) + (1-\alpha)\mathcal{E}\left(\frac{v(Y)}{1-\alpha}\right)
 \end{aligned}$$

- ▶ Pick  $\alpha = \frac{v(X)}{v(X)+v(Y)}$  and the above inequality becomes

$$h(X + Y) \geq \mathcal{E}(v(X) + v(Y)),$$

and applying  $\mathcal{E}^{-1}$  to both sides gives the EPI.

# Rephrased EPI

## Rephrased EPI

- ▶ Note that this choice of  $\alpha$  makes  $v(X^*) = v(Y^*) = v(X) + v(Y)$ .

## Rephrased EPI

- ▶ Note that this choice of  $\alpha$  makes  $v(X^*) = v(Y^*) = v(X) + v(Y)$ .
- ▶ This choice of scaling suggests the following rephrased EPI:

### Corollary (Rephrased EPI)

*Given independent  $X$  and  $Y$  with finite variance, there exist  $X^*$  and  $Y^*$  such that  $X = \sqrt{\alpha}X^*$  and  $Y = \sqrt{1 - \alpha}Y^*$  for some  $\alpha$ , and such that  $h(X^*) = h(Y^*)$ .*

*The EPI is equivalent to the fact that*

$$h(X + Y) \geq h(X^*), \quad (2)$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Gaussian.*

# Property 3: Monotonicity



## Property 3: Monotonicity

- ▶ Exciting set of strong recent results, collectively referred to as 'monotonicity'.

## Property 3: Monotonicity

- ▶ Exciting set of strong recent results, collectively referred to as 'monotonicity'.
- ▶ First proved by Artstein/Ball/Barthe/Naor, alternative proofs by Tulino/Verdú and Madiman/Barron.

## Monotonicity theorem

### Theorem

Given independent continuous  $X_i$  with finite variance, for any positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then

$$nh \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \sqrt{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} h \left( \sum_{i \neq j} \sqrt{\alpha_i / \alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

## Monotonicity theorem

### Theorem

Given independent continuous  $X_i$  with finite variance, for any positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then

$$nh \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \sqrt{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} h \left( \sum_{i \neq j} \sqrt{\alpha_i / \alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

- ▶ Choosing  $\alpha_i = 1/(n+1)$  for IID  $X_i$  shows  $h(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i / \sqrt{n})$  is monotone increasing in  $n$ .

## Monotonicity theorem

### Theorem

Given independent continuous  $X_i$  with finite variance, for any positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then

$$nh \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \sqrt{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} h \left( \sum_{i \neq j} \sqrt{\alpha_i / \alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

- ▶ Choosing  $\alpha_i = 1/(n+1)$  for IID  $X_i$  shows  $h(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i / \sqrt{n})$  is monotone increasing in  $n$ .
- ▶ Equivalently relative entropy  $D(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i / \sqrt{n} \| Z)$  is monotone decreasing in  $n$ .

## Monotonicity theorem

### Theorem

Given independent continuous  $X_i$  with finite variance, for any positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then

$$nh \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \sqrt{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} h \left( \sum_{i \neq j} \sqrt{\alpha_i / \alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

- ▶ Choosing  $\alpha_i = 1/(n+1)$  for IID  $X_i$  shows  $h(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i / \sqrt{n})$  is monotone increasing in  $n$ .
- ▶ Equivalently relative entropy  $D(\sum_{i=1}^n X_i / \sqrt{n} \| Z)$  is monotone decreasing in  $n$ .
- ▶ Means CLT is equivalent of 2nd Law of Thermodynamics?

# Monotonicity strengthens EPI

## Monotonicity strengthens EPI

- ▶ By the right choice of  $\alpha$ , monotonicity implies the following strengthened EPI.

### Theorem (Strengthened EPI)

*Given independent continuous  $Y_i$  with finite variance, the entropy powers satisfy*

$$nv \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} Y_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} v \left( \sum_{i \neq j} Y_i \right),$$

*with equality if and only if all the  $Y_i$  are Gaussian.*



# Discrete Property 1: Poisson maximum entropy

## Definition

For any  $\lambda$ , define class of ultra-log-concave  $V$  with mass function  $p_V$  satisfying

$$\mathbf{ULC}(\lambda) = \{V : \mathbb{E}V = \lambda \text{ and } p_V(i)/\Pi_\lambda(i) \text{ is log-concave}\}.$$

## Discrete Property 1: Poisson maximum entropy

### Definition

For any  $\lambda$ , define class of ultra-log-concave  $V$  with mass function  $p_V$  satisfying

$$\mathbf{ULC}(\lambda) = \{V : \mathbb{E}V = \lambda \text{ and } p_V(i)/\Pi_\lambda(i) \text{ is log-concave}\}.$$

That is

$$ip_V(i)^2 \geq (i+1)p_V(i+1)p_V(i-1), \text{ for all } i.$$

## Discrete Property 1: Poisson maximum entropy

### Definition

For any  $\lambda$ , define class of ultra-log-concave  $V$  with mass function  $p_V$  satisfying

$$\mathbf{ULC}(\lambda) = \{V : \mathbb{E}V = \lambda \text{ and } p_V(i)/\Pi_\lambda(i) \text{ is log-concave}\}.$$

That is

$$ip_V(i)^2 \geq (i+1)p_V(i+1)p_V(i-1), \text{ for all } i.$$

- ▶ Class includes Bernoulli sums and Poisson.

# Maximum entropy and **ULC**( $\lambda$ )

Theorem (Johnson, Stoch. Proc. Appl. 2007)

If  $X \in \mathbf{ULC}(\lambda)$  and  $Y \sim \Pi_\lambda$  then

$$H(X) \leq H(Y),$$

with equality if and only if  $X \sim \Pi_\lambda$ .

(see also Harremoës, 2001)

## Key operation: thinning

### Definition

Given  $Y$ , define the  $\alpha$ -thinned version of  $Y$  by

$$T_\alpha Y = \sum_{i=1}^Y B_i,$$

where  $B_1, B_2 \dots$  i.i.d. Bernoulli( $\alpha$ ), independent of  $Y$ .

## Key operation: thinning

### Definition

Given  $Y$ , define the  $\alpha$ -thinned version of  $Y$  by

$$T_\alpha Y = \sum_{i=1}^Y B_i,$$

where  $B_1, B_2 \dots$  i.i.d. Bernoulli( $\alpha$ ), independent of  $Y$ .

- ▶ Thinning has many interesting properties.

## Key operation: thinning

### Definition

Given  $Y$ , define the  $\alpha$ -thinned version of  $Y$  by

$$T_\alpha Y = \sum_{i=1}^Y B_i,$$

where  $B_1, B_2, \dots$  i.i.d. Bernoulli( $\alpha$ ), independent of  $Y$ .

- ▶ Thinning has many interesting properties.
- ▶ We believe  $T_\alpha$  is the discrete equivalent of scaling by  $\sqrt{\alpha}$ .

## Key operation: thinning

### Definition

Given  $Y$ , define the  $\alpha$ -thinned version of  $Y$  by

$$T_\alpha Y = \sum_{i=1}^Y B_i,$$

where  $B_1, B_2 \dots$  i.i.d. Bernoulli( $\alpha$ ), independent of  $Y$ .

- ▶ Thinning has many interesting properties.
- ▶ We believe  $T_\alpha$  is the discrete equivalent of scaling by  $\sqrt{\alpha}$ .
- ▶ Preserves several parametric families.



## Key operation: thinning

### Definition

Given  $Y$ , define the  $\alpha$ -thinned version of  $Y$  by

$$T_\alpha Y = \sum_{i=1}^Y B_i,$$

where  $B_1, B_2 \dots$  i.i.d. Bernoulli( $\alpha$ ), independent of  $Y$ .

- ▶ Thinning has many interesting properties.
- ▶ We believe  $T_\alpha$  is the discrete equivalent of scaling by  $\sqrt{\alpha}$ .
- ▶ Preserves several parametric families.
- ▶ 'Mean-preserving transform'  $T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y$  equivalent to 'variance-preserving transform'  $\sqrt{\alpha} X + \sqrt{1-\alpha} Y$  in continuous case? (Matches max. ent. condition).

# Discrete Property 2: EPI

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.
- ▶ Define  $V(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(H(X))$ .

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.
- ▶ Define  $V(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(H(X))$ .

### Conjecture

*Consider independent discrete  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$V(X + Y) \geq V(X) + V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.
- ▶ Define  $V(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(H(X))$ .

### Conjecture

*Consider independent discrete  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$V(X + Y) \geq V(X) + V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Turns out not to be true!

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.
- ▶ Define  $V(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(H(X))$ .

### Conjecture

*Consider independent discrete  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$V(X + Y) \geq V(X) + V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Turns out not to be true!
- ▶ Even natural restrictions e.g. ULC, Bernoulli sums don't help

## Discrete Property 2: EPI

- ▶ Define  $\mathcal{E}(t) = H(\Pi_t)$ , an increasing, concave function.
- ▶ Define  $V(X) = \mathcal{E}^{-1}(H(X))$ .

### Conjecture

*Consider independent discrete  $X$  and  $Y$ . Then*

$$V(X + Y) \geq V(X) + V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Turns out not to be true!
- ▶ Even natural restrictions e.g. ULC, Bernoulli sums don't help
- ▶ Counterexample (not mine!):  $X \sim Y$ ,  
 $P_X(0) = 1/6$ ,  $P_X(1) = 2/3$ ,  $P_X(2) = 1/6$ .



# Thinned Entropy Power Inequality

## Conjecture (TEPI)

*Consider independent discrete ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ , conjecture that*

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

# Thinned Entropy Power Inequality

## Conjecture (TEPI)

*Consider independent discrete ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ , conjecture that*

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Again, not true in general!

# Thinned Entropy Power Inequality

## Conjecture (TEPI)

*Consider independent discrete ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ , conjecture that*

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Again, not true in general!
- ▶ Perhaps not all  $\alpha$ ?

# Thinned Entropy Power Inequality

## Conjecture (TEPI)

*Consider independent discrete ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ , conjecture that*

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y),$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

- ▶ Again, not true in general!
- ▶ Perhaps not all  $\alpha$ ?
- ▶ Have partial results, but not full description of which  $\alpha$ .

# Thinned Entropy Power Inequality

## Conjecture (TEPI)

Consider independent discrete ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ , conjecture that

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y),$$

with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.

- ▶ Again, not true in general!
- ▶ Perhaps not all  $\alpha$ ?
- ▶ Have partial results, but not full description of which  $\alpha$ .
- ▶ For example, true for Poisson  $Y$  with  $H(Y) \leq H(X)$ .

## Two weaker results

## Two weaker results

- ▶ Analogues of the continuous concavity and scaling results do hold. (Again, proofs not given here!)

### Theorem (TECI, Johnson/Yu, ISIT '09)

Consider independent ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ . For any  $\alpha$ ,

$$H(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha H(X) + (1 - \alpha) H(Y).$$

### Theorem (RTEPI, Johnson/Yu, arXiv:0909.0641)

Consider ULC  $X$ . For any  $\alpha$ ,

$$V(T_\alpha X) \geq \alpha V(X).$$

# Discrete EPI?



## Discrete EPI?

- ▶ Duplicating steps from the continuous case above, we deduce an analogue of rephrased EPI

Theorem (Johnson/Yu, arXiv:0909.0641)

*Given independent ULC  $X$  and  $Y$ , suppose there exist  $X^*$  and  $Y^*$  such that  $X = T_\alpha X^*$  and  $Y = T_{1-\alpha} Y^*$  for some  $\alpha$ , and such that  $H(X^*) = H(Y^*)$ . Then*

$$H(X + Y) \geq H(X^*), \quad (3)$$

*with equality if and only if  $X$  and  $Y$  are Poisson.*

# Discrete Property 3: Monotonicity

## Discrete Property 3: Monotonicity

- ▶ Write  $D(X)$  for  $D(X \parallel \Pi_{\mathbb{E}X})$ .

## Discrete Property 3: Monotonicity

- ▶ Write  $D(X)$  for  $D(X\|\Pi_{\mathbb{E}X})$ .
- ▶ By convex ordering arguments, Yu showed that for IID  $X_i$ :
  1. relative entropy  $D(\sum_{i=1}^n T_{1/n}X_i)$  is monotone decreasing in  $n$ ,
  2. for ULC  $X_i$  the entropy  $H(\sum_{i=1}^n T_{1/n}X_i)$  is monotone increasing in  $n$ .

## Discrete Property 3: Monotonicity

- ▶ Write  $D(X)$  for  $D(X \parallel \Pi_{\mathbb{E}X})$ .
- ▶ By convex ordering arguments, Yu showed that for IID  $X_i$ :
  1. relative entropy  $D(\sum_{i=1}^n T_{1/n} X_i)$  is monotone decreasing in  $n$ ,
  2. for ULC  $X_i$  the entropy  $H(\sum_{i=1}^n T_{1/n} X_i)$  is monotone increasing in  $n$ .
- ▶ In fact, implicit in work of Yu is following stronger theorem:

### Theorem

Given positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , and writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then for any independent ULC  $X_i$ ,

$$nD\left(\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} T_{\alpha_i} X_i\right) \leq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} D\left(\sum_{i \neq j} T_{\alpha_i/\alpha^{(j)}} X_i\right).$$

## Generalization of monotonicity

Theorem (Johnson/Yu, arXiv:0909.0641)

Given positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , and writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then for any independent ULC  $X_i$ ,

$$nH \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} T_{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} H \left( \sum_{i \neq j} T_{\alpha_i / \alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

## Generalization of monotonicity

Theorem (Johnson/Yu, arXiv:0909.0641)

Given positive  $\alpha_i$  such that  $\sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \alpha_i = 1$ , and writing  $\alpha^{(j)} = 1 - \alpha_j$ , then for any independent ULC  $X_i$ ,

$$nH \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} T_{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} H \left( \sum_{i \neq j} T_{\alpha_i/\alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right).$$

- ▶ Exact analogue of Artstein/Ball/Barthe/Naor result,

$$nh \left( \sum_{i=1}^{n+1} \sqrt{\alpha_i} X_i \right) \geq \sum_{j=1}^{n+1} \alpha^{(j)} h \left( \sum_{i \neq j} \sqrt{\alpha_i/\alpha^{(j)}} X_i \right),$$

replacing scalings by thinnings.

# Future work



## Future work

- Resolve for which  $\alpha$ , the

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y).$$

## Future work

- ▶ Resolve for which  $\alpha$ , the

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y).$$

- ▶ Relation to Shepp-Olkin conjecture

## Future work

- ▶ Resolve for which  $\alpha$ , the

$$V(T_\alpha X + T_{1-\alpha} Y) \geq \alpha V(X) + (1 - \alpha)V(Y).$$

- ▶ Relation to Shepp-Olkin conjecture
- ▶ **Conjecture:** if there exist  $X^*$  and  $Y^*$  such that  $X = T_\alpha X^*$  and  $Y = T_{1-\alpha} Y^*$ , where  $\alpha = V(X)/(V(X) + V(Y))$ , then

$$V(X + Y) \geq V(X) + V(Y).$$